

DRAFT Comparative Analysis

ACCESS ROAD ALTERNATIVES

<u>Categories of Concern</u>	<u>Causeway 1</u>	<u>Causeway 2</u>	<u>Dune Road</u>	<u>Dune and At-grade road</u>	<u>Berm/Culverts</u>	<u>Emergency Access Route</u>	
Proposal Description:	SFHA	SFHA moved Inland 50-100'	Manmade dune with road on inland side	Road behind manmade dune	At-grade route with culverts. No dune	Across Great Island	
<u>Environmental Impacts:</u>							
Wetlands:	20-24 piles	24-28 piles	5,000 SF initially, plus 5-10,000 SF every 10 yrs.	5,000 SF for road, and 5-10,000 SF for dune every 10 yrs.	5,000 SF	Water crossing 300-400 feet	
	Shadows	Shadows					
Runoff to Pond:	From causeway 7,200 SF	8,000 SF	From dune = 25,000 SF (60' wide x 420' long)	25,000 SF dune + 5,500 SF 5,500 SF from road			
Coastal dune impacts:	Widened access road 4,000 SF	4,000 SF	-	-	-	10,000 SF	
Marshland, etc.	26-30 piles	22-26 piles	20,000-25,000 SF	20,000-25,000 +	Small area	Portion of 10,000 SF	
Endangered species							
Beach expansion		Could be negotiated with any access alternative					
Pond access	Yes	Yes	?	?	?		
Overland water Flow	Over area of former parking		Restricted by dune	Restricted by dune	Area of former parking lot		
Durability	SW abutment Questionable	OK	Requires annual maintenance plus periodic major reconstruction		May require reconstruction	Annual maintenance	
<u>Approvals:</u>							
Wetlands		Minor issues	Major issues	Major + issues	Some issues	Major issues	
Other							
<u>Visual Impacts:</u>							
	View of causeway		View of manmade dune with road on it	View of dune and a separate roadway only	View of roadway on berm	View of bridge	
		Seen fully by 8 houses, partially by 3. All these houses now view existing parking lot					Seen by ?
<u>Property Requirements:</u>							
	None	Lot 17-4	Lot 17-4	Lots 17-3 & 17.4	Lot 17.3 or 17.4		

<u>Categories of Concern</u>	<u>Causeway 1</u>	<u>Causeway 2</u>	<u>Dune Road</u>	<u>At Grade</u>	<u>Berm/Culverts</u>	<u>Emergency. Route</u>
<u>Constructability:</u>						
Noise	Pile driving		Truck traffic (initially & periodically		-	
Maintenance	Minimal		Annual or oftener when severe storms		After severe storms	Annual
Reconstruction	No		Every 10 years		Possibly?	
<u>Financial:</u>						
Initial cost	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$
Annual cost	0	0	\$\$	\$\$	\$	\$
Periodic cost	small	small	\$\$	\$\$	\$	\$
Payer	SFHA	SFHA	?	?	SFHA	?
Beach permit rev.*	+\$	+\$	\$	\$?	
State funds avail.						
Impact on Town finances						

Notes: *assumes expanded beach is part of SFHA deal.