



TOWN OF CHILMARK, MASSACHUSETTS

401 MIDDLE ROAD
POST OFFICE BOX 119
CHILMARK, MA 02535
508.645.2107
508.645.2110 FAX
jchristy@chilmarkma.gov

Jennifer L. Christy
Planning Board Administrator

To: Honorable Board of Selectmen
From: Jennifer L. Christy, Admin. Asst. to the Chilmark Planning Board
Re: Peaked Hill Pastures Report
Date: December 23, 2019

As part of the continuing work to prepare a recommended plan for the Peaked Hill Pasture site, the Planning Board has completed a review of the recent affordable housing projects in Aquinnah and West Tisbury: Smalley's Knoll and Scott's Grove. The Board members used the gathered information to identify outcomes of each of the projects. As requested, please see the attached document illustrating this information. The attached document builds on the Peaked Hill Pastures progress report that was submitted to you for your meeting on June 4, 2019.

Currently, the Planning Board has been working to identify how the Martha's Vineyard Commission (MVC) may assist with the development of a recommendation for the Peaked Hill Pastures site. Christine Flynn, MVC Affordable Housing Planner, will be helping to guide the Board to possible grant money that may be used to develop this plan.

Additionally, the Planning Board, at their meeting on Monday, December 16, 2019, discussed the need for a complete survey of the Peaked Hill Pastures site. The Planning Board members look forward to discussing, at your January 7th meeting, the best way to move forward with funding for a survey of the site.

Members of the Planning Board will attend your Tuesday, January 7, 2020, 5PM meeting to discuss the outcomes of recent affordable housing developments on the island and to pursue funding for a complete site survey of Peaked Hill Pastures.

Chilmark Planning Board

Richard Osnoss
Mitchell Posin

Peter Cook
Catherine Thompson
Ann Wallace

Janet Weidner
Chris MacLeod

Peaked Hill Pastures
An Analysis of Affordable Housing Options
Pros & Cons
December 23, 2019

On June 4, 2019, the Planning Board reported to the Board of Selectmen on the progress towards developing a detailed recommendation and plan for the Peaked Hill Pastures site.

A key part of the progress report listed 4 types of models that Chilmark may consider for developing housing on a portion of the town-owned property at Peaked Hill Pastures*:

- Ownership Homesites/U-Build Homes (ex. Middle Line Road & Nab's Corner Chilmark)
- Ownership Homesites/Turnkey Homes (ex. Smalley's Knoll in Aquinnah)
- Rental Homesites/Town as Developer (ex. Middle Line Road in Chilmark)
- Rental Homesites/Developer (ex. Scott's Grove in West Tisbury)

The progress report described each model, including specific considerations and the long-term "on-going" management required.

At the November 19, 2019 Board of Selectmen's Meeting, the Planning Board was requested to develop a "Pros & Cons" analysis of the Scott's Grove housing development in West Tisbury (WT) comprised of 9 rental units.

The Planning Board accepted this task and included an analysis of the Town of Aquinnah's (AQ) Smalley's Knoll development (2 turnkey dwellings for ownership). Board members spoke with Philippe Jordi and Derrill Bazy at the Island Housing Trust (IHT) office and had phone conversations with Matt Merry (WT Planning Board) and Peter Temple (former member of the AQ Plan Review Committee) to discuss the process and results of these two affordable housing projects.

The affordable housing options outlined in the June 2019 progress report fall basically into two categories: housing requiring minimal funding on the part of the Town and housing requiring significant funding on the part of the Town.

The Scott's Grove housing development in West Tisbury and the Smalley's Knoll housing development in Aquinnah both fall into the latter category, requiring significant Town funding.

This report looks at the takeaways from the Board's analysis so far and suggests a couple of next steps. Due to the fact that the input from IHT and WT & AQ officials did not reveal many negatives, the Board has arranged the information under "Key points" and "For further consideration", rather than a listing of Pros and Cons.

*see appendix for chart "Chilmark Housing Options" from the June 4, 2019 Peaked Hill Pastures progress report

Key points:

- Overall, there seems to be very little on the negative side to report.
- Matt Merry, WT Planning Board Member, gave IHT very good marks for communicating with neighbors, overcoming initial opposition, listening to the various local concerns, and making adjustments
- Scott's Grove was termed "a win for the town" by Mr. Merry
- Peter Temple, former AQ Plan Review Committee member, noted siting was the big issue for the two single-family dwellings at Smalley's Knoll in Aquinnah
- Zoning in Aquinnah had to be examined and dealt with
- Derrill Bazzey, of IHT, shepherded the project ably and the town is pleased with the result.

Further considerations:

- One issue that warrants further discussion/investigation is the financial arrangement that was negotiated in West Tisbury with IHT- it would be useful for someone on the Chilmark Finance Committee to review that process
- Representatives from IHT explained their process in detail, emphasizing the significant savings they have been able to achieve, especially in design and construction costs, largely due to the applicability of their plans—building on what they had learned from previous projects for Scott's Grove and being able to use so much of the Scott's Grove experience in their next project at Kuehn's Way.
- One of the pertinent features of both projects is leaving room to add value in the future: Scott's Grove could add solar panels at some point, and both houses at Smalley's Knoll were delivered with unfinished areas (basement and attic) that could be developed by the owners.

Recommended Next Steps:

- Commission a detailed survey of the entire plot, identifying areas unsuited to housing or other construction
- Solidify our understanding of the Town's preferences as to what housing strategy to pursue (ownership/rental, u-build or turnkey, etc.)

Appendix

Chilmark Housing Options (up to 150% Area Median Income)

Notes

Model	Description	Considerations	On-going Management
Ownership Homesite lots with "U-build" homes (e.g., Middle Line Road, Nabs Corner)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lottery to award property Town provides basic infrastructure Owner builds home (U-build) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides affordable land Remains affordable for 99+ years U-builds can get overextended with building mortgage 1 acre restricts creative density planning Requires little or no town funding 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Minimal management required Home owner responsible for capital improvements, repairs and replacement, etc. to home
Ownership Homesite lots with Turnkey homes (e.g., Smalley's Knoll, AQ) Town or Developer	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lottery to award property and home Town or developer builds homes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides affordable land and home Remains affordable for 99+ years Lenders prefer turnkey homes Provides opportunity for creative density planning Requires town funding: significant if town is developer; moderate if in partnership with a developer 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Minimal management required Home owner responsible for capital improvements, repairs and replacement, etc. to home
Rental Town as developer (e.g., Middle Line Road)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Town develops and builds rental units Initial rental lottery 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides perpetual affordable rental units Provides opportunity for creative density planning Requires significant town funding 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Town contracts with management company or town manages rentals Rental income covers capital improvements, repairs and replacement, etc.
Rental Developer (e.g., Scotts Grove, WT)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developer develops and builds rental units Initial rental lottery 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides perpetual affordable rental units Provides opportunity for creative density planning Requires moderate town funding with multiple funding sources 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Town contracts with management company or town manages rentals Rental income covers capital improvements, repairs and replacement, etc.

In all models, town retains ownership of land